United Nations A/HRC/31/75



## **General Assembly**

Distr.: General 22 February 2016

Original: English

#### **Human Rights Council**

Thirty-first session

Agenda item 9

Racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related forms of intolerance: follow-up to and implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action

Report of the Intergovernmental Working Group on the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action on its thirteenth session\*, \*\*

Chair-Rapporteur: Mohamed Siad Douale (Djibouti)

#### Summary

The Intergovernmental Working Group on the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action held its thirteenth session from 5 to 15 October 2015. The present report contains a summary of the deliberations of the session.

The annexes to the report are reproduced as received, in the language of submission only.





<sup>\*</sup> The present report was submitted after the deadline in order to reflect the most recent developments.

### Contents

			Page			
I.	Introduction					
II.	Organization of the session					
	A.	Attendance	3			
	B.	Opening of the session	3			
	C.	Election of the Chair-Rapporteur.	3			
	D.	Adoption of the agenda and programme of work	4			
	E.	Statements	4			
III.	Discussion concerning the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent					
IV.	Discussion concerning the preparations for the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action		10			
V.	Discussion concerning racism and poverty		11			
VI.	Final statements					
VII.	Conc	lusions and recommendations	15			
		Implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent	15			
		Preparations for the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action	16			
	C.	Racism and poverty	17			
Annexes						
I.	List of attendance					
II.	Programme of work					

#### I. Introduction

1. The present report is submitted by the Intergovernmental Working Group on the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 11/12 and decision 3/103.

#### II. Organization of the session

2. The Intergovernmental Working Group held its thirteenth session from 5 to 16 October 2015. Participants shared experiences, including best practices, regarding the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent and discussed the preparations for the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action. The Working Group held a thematic discussion on racism and poverty. Experts' presentations were followed by interactive discussions. The Working Group adopted conclusions and recommendations on the above-mentioned themes.

#### A. Attendance

- 3. The session was attended by representatives of States Members of the United Nations, observers from non-member States and observers from intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations.
- 4. Under item 5 of the programme of work, presentations were made by Dozie Celeste Ugochukwu, President of the African Diaspora Council of Switzerland and a member of the Swiss Federal Commission against Racism; Carole Boyce Davies, Professor of African Studies at Cornell University; and Yury Boychenko, Chief of the Anti-Racial Discrimination Section, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR).
- 5. Under item 8 of the programme of work, presentations were made by David Woodward, Senior Adviser, United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD); Marcelo Jorge de Paila Paixão, Associate Professor of African and African Diaspora Studies at the University of Texas at Austin; Jotaka Eaddy, adviser on government and regulatory affairs for Silicon Valley-based companies; Carlos Augusto Viáfara López, Associate Professor, Universidad del Valle in Cali, Colombia; Gay McDougall, member of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination; and Mutuma Ruteere, Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

#### B. Opening of the session

6. On 5 October 2015, Mr. Boychenko opened the session.

#### C. Election of the Chair-Rapporteur

7. The Permanent Representative of Djibouti to the United Nations in Geneva, Mohamed Siad Douale, was re-elected Chair-Rapporteur by acclamation.

#### D. Adoption of the agenda and programme of work

8. After the election of the Chair, the Working Group adopted the agenda and programme of work for its thirteenth session.

#### E. Statements

- The representative of Brazil noted that the work carried out by the Working Group was of great importance. The full and effective implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action by all States was fundamental for the prevention and elimination of racism and racial discrimination in all regions. In Brazil, the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action had inspired legislation, plans of actions and public policies on the promotion of racial equality. The representative welcomed the three key issues that would be discussed in the session: (a) the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent; (b) the preparations for the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action; and (c) racism and poverty. The representative also reiterated the support of Brazil for the International Decade and for the implementation of the programme of activities, and emphasized the importance of the decision to establish a forum on people of African descent. The representative informed the Working Group that on 3 and 4 December 2015, Brazil would host, in Brasilia, the Regional Meeting for Latin America and the Caribbean on the International Decade for People of African Descent. The representative of Brazil invited all delegations to assess both the progress that was achieved in fighting racism and racial discrimination and the important challenges that still remained.
- The representative of the European Union said that they had entered the session with a sincere and constructive approach, hoping that all partner countries would join in showing a similar constructive spirit to strengthen the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, as that was the stated objective of the Working Group. They were also pleased with the three topics chosen for the session, which would allow the Working Group to take stock of progress in the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent and discuss activities marking the fifteenth anniversary of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action. The representative added that the European Union was particularly pleased to discuss the issue of racism and poverty, which was highly relevant in relation to the new Sustainable Development Goals, which were recently adopted in New York, which could bring real progress in putting an end to discrimination on any grounds and help to further protect and promote human rights for all. The representative stressed that priority should be given to the effective implementation of existing international human rights law, in particular the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, given that its full implementation remained a challenge for many countries.
- 11. The representative of the Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) stated that racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related forms of intolerance negated the core human rights principles of equality, non-discrimination, human dignity and cultural and religious diversity. In recent years, there had been an alarming increase in incidents of new and contemporary forms of racism, manifested in the form of religious intolerance, racial profiling, xenophobic acts, negative stereotyping and stigmatization, hate speech and incitement to racial and religious hatred. Therefore, it was vital to counter these scourges through the full and effective implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and the outcome document of the Durban Review Conference. The representative recalled that the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and

Related Intolerance, held in Durban in 2001, recognized the existence of religious intolerance against certain religious communities owing to their religious beliefs. In that regard, it was imperative to implement paragraph 150 of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and paragraphs 13 and 127 of the outcome document of the Durban Review Conference with regard to religious intolerance and discrimination, with a view to combating new and contemporary forms of racism. In that regard, OIC also recognized the urgent need to prepare complementary standards to strengthen and update international instruments against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance in all their aspects, in accordance with paragraph 199 of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action.

- 12. The representative of Egypt noted that it was alarming to know that, despite sincere efforts aimed at eradicating the phenomenon of racism worldwide, there was a growing trend towards racism in many countries, thus threatening the principles of equality and nondiscrimination as core human rights. The representative noted that Egypt was concerned by the rise of racist and discriminatory trends based on extremist ideologies that propagate religious intolerance, defamation of religions, racial profiling and stigmatization, and incitement to racial and religious hatred. The ongoing refugee crisis in the Mediterranean Sea was a clear example that demonstrated the extent that the phenomenon of racism had reached. Egypt believed that in order for the international community to effectively counter that scourge of racism, concerted efforts should be made, with a view to realizing full and effective implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and the outcome document of the Durban Review Conference. The representative expressed the view that effectively combating evolving forms of racism and various discriminatory activities might not be realized without formulating complementary standards to international instruments against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.
- 13. The representatives of Algeria, Pakistan, Libya and the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela affirmed their commitment to the fight against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

# III. Discussion concerning the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent

- 14. Mr. Ugochukwu made a presentation on the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent. He recalled a number of United Nations resolutions that mentioned people of African descent and presented options as to the meaning of the term. He noted that the term "people of African descent" could refer to the territory, that is, people who have their ancestral roots in Africa and are living outside the continent of Africa; it could refer to a distant time, that is, to people who had their ancestral roots in Africa centuries ago but were victims of slavery; and it could refer to every human being that had his/her ancestral roots in Africa (origin) irrespective of where he/she lived.
- 15. Mr. Ugochukwu then talked about the causes of African emigration, including both internal factors (political: power struggles, manipulation of elections, regional domination; economic: deprivation, poverty, resource control; socio-anthropological: ethnic rivalry; and belief: religion, occultism) and external factors, such as former colonial powers' support of dictatorships, the collapse of uncompromising regimes, the exploitation of mineral resources and colonialism.

- 16. Mr. Ugochukwu also presented an overview of migration policies and the promotion of intra-African migration and labour mobility. He made a number of recommendations, such as the introduction of effective laws and remedies for victims; better economic integration; community counselling; improved statistics; and the promotion of intercultural community life.
- 17. Finally, Mr. Ugochukwu presented an action plan for the implementation of the Decade. The plan foresaw the establishment of a strategic working group under the auspices of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights; and a strong link to economic policies to boost trade, investment, migration and labour mobility. He also suggested the convening of a world congress for people of African descent in 2016 and the creation of a Marshall Plan for peoples of African descent.
- Ms. Davies made a presentation on Haiti: landscape, nation and living on the fault lines of the African diaspora. She said that the important iconic history of Haiti, as the first place where black resistance to enslavement became manifest as black freedom, provided a way of looking at the contradictory history of the experience of people of African descent worldwide. This contradictory history of Haiti, which produced today's poorest country in the Western hemisphere, is set against a history of glory and transcendence. She said that in many ways, therefore, Haiti had become an important and extreme representation of "the black condition". The country had, on the one hand, a past of dignity and legendary greatness and, on the other, the starkness of its initial history of dispossession and economic difficulty. This history had been brought on sometimes by horrendous leadership, often in collusion with external actors, as well as environment, climate and location, but through it all the people of Haiti had shown amazing resilience, matched by their outstanding creativity. She then presented information about the Caribbean Studies Association Annual Conference that would be held in Haiti from 5 to 11 June 2016, and stressed the important and necessary involvement of the United Nations at the Conference, through the International Decade for People of African Descent.
- 19. Mr. Boychenko gave a presentation on the activities undertaken by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in relation to the implementation of the activities under the Decade. He noted that people of African descent comprised a heterogeneous group with diverse histories, experiences and identities. The circumstances in which they lived and the problems they faced differed from country to country and from region to region. There were around 200 million people of African descent living in the Americas and many millions more on the other continents. Whether as descendants of the victims of the slave trade or as more recent migrants, they faced a series of global crosscutting issues that must be addressed.
- 20. Mr. Boychecko pointed out that the International Decade for People of African Descent provided an occasion to promote greater knowledge, value and respect for achievements of people of African descent and their contributions to humanity. The Decade will strengthen action to dismantle the many obstacles encountered by millions of people around the world. The General Assembly, by its resolution 69/16 of 18 November 2014, adopted the programme of activities for the implementation of the Decade. In the resolution, the Assembly identified the objectives for the Decade, provided an overview of the situation of people of African descent in the world and recommended activities to be carried out.
- 21. Mr. Boychecko noted that the General Assembly, in the programme of activities, had set out specific actions that relevant United Nations agencies, funds and programmes should undertake in pursuit of the objectives of the Decade. To implement the programme of activities for the Decade, the Office and other United Nations entities had undertaken activities in the following areas:

- Capacity-building: the Office had paid special attention to strengthening knowledge and practical expertise in human rights among leaders of African descent, in particular through its Fellowship Programme for People of African Descent.
- Empowerment: in the programme of activities, the Assembly recommended the establishment of a forum for people of African descent to serve as a consultation mechanism. It would be a place where the voices of people of African descent could be heard. The Human Rights Council is expected to take action and provide guidance on the forum's format and modalities.
- Awareness-raising: the Department of Public Information, OHCHR and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) were carrying out an awareness-raising campaign to inform the general public of the history, contributions, challenges, contemporary experiences and situation of human rights of people of African descent.
- 22. Mr. Boychenko concluded by saying that while the General Assembly had approved a budget for the implementation of the Decade, its success would depend upon the mobilization of additional resources to undertake important initiatives outlined in the programme of activities which were not covered by the regular budget.
- 23. During the discussion that followed, a representative of the International Youth and Student Movement for the United Nations noted that at the end of the 18th century many great revolutions, such as the American or the French revolutions, occurred. Few people knew however, about the revolution in Haiti, even though that revolution established the first republic that did not allow slavery. Polish soldiers who were sent to suppress the uprising did not follow their orders, as they did not want to participate in massacres. Such behaviour underlined the idea of "non-racial citizenship" and exemplified the importance of the Haitian revolution for the development of human rights.
- 24. The representative of Morocco said that history needed to be revisited and commemorative sites could play a major role in doing so. Contemporary migration was reminiscent of the earlier diaspora. Ms. Davies noted that indeed, many sites were used as commemorative sites. This was, however, not the case in Haiti.
- 25. Mr. Ugochukwu and Ms. Davies called for a Marshall Plan for people of African descent and said that it should focus on infrastructure. Ms. Davies noted that such a plan should be extended to the Caribbean, as infrastructure was indeed essential. In addition, she called for the establishment of a think tank that dealt with issues concerning the African diaspora.
- 26. The representative of South Africa pointed out that a Working Group on People of African Descent, which functioned as a think tank, already existed. In addition, there were plans to establish the forum within the framework of the Decade. The modalities for the forum should be clearly defined; it could have a consultative status for the Decade.
- 27. The representative of India made a statement, underlining his country's commitment regarding the fight against discrimination and racism.
- 28. Speaking in reference to the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent, the representative of Brazil reaffirmed the country's commitment to the full implementation of all relevant international instruments and stated that Brazil was a multiracial, multi-ethnic and multicultural society, which had the largest population of people of African descent in the world. As the national census conducted in 2010 documented, more than half of the Brazilian population, about 100 million people, declared themselves as people of African descent. Brazil reiterated its full support for the Decade, with the theme "People of African descent: recognition, justice and development". As recalled by Mr. Boychenko, that theme should guide the work on the Decade. The

representative stated that Brazil was fully committed to the implementation of the programme of activities of the Decade, as adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 69/16. In that context, the representative emphasized the importance of the decision to establish a forum on people of African Descent, with broad and inclusive participation of people of African descent. It should be a place where the voices of people of African descent would be heard. Brazil was very honoured to host, on 3 and 4 December 2015, in Brasilia, the Regional Meeting for Latin America and the Caribbean on the International Decade for People of African Descent. It would be the first regional meeting on the Decade, and would provide an opportunity to identify challenges and exchange good practices on the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade in the region. People of African descent from all over the region would be able to participate in the meeting. The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights would also participate, as the coordinator of the Decade.

- 29. The representative of the European Union, in reference to the implementation of the Decade, noted that the adoption by the General Assembly of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent marked a remarkable recognition by the international community of the ongoing challenges faced by people of African descent in all regions. Too often, people of African descent faced racial discrimination and denial of basic human rights, such as access to health care, jobs, housing and education. The programme of activities contained many excellent recommendations to address the challenges faced by people of African descent. Of particular importance was the priority given to the effective implementation of the national and international framework in combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. The International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination was a key instrument, and the international community needed to step up its full and effective implementation worldwide, as this still remained a challenge to many countries. All European Union member States had ratified and implemented this convention. The European Union would welcome and support possible United Nations events in Geneva and elsewhere to mark the fiftieth anniversary of the Convention. Some European Union members (Belgium and Slovenia) had already hosted a high-level event to mark the upcoming fiftieth anniversary of the Convention.
- 30. The representative of Colombia talked about the country's experience regarding the implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent. He stressed the need to combat exclusion. He emphasized that the Working Group had to talk about concrete measures on the ground and therefore the implementation of the programme of activities. There was a need to launch new public policies that would follow a holistic approach and take into account different sectors of society and regions within a country. Public policies needed to benefit from broad participation, including by academia and civil society. In Colombia a number of activities had been initiated. Colombia had, for example, created an intersectoral commission that was part of a national development plan. National campaigns against racism would be launched in the years to come. Those campaigns aimed at making people more aware of the issue. Similar campaigns should be launched at the global level.
- 31. The representative of South Africa also spoke about the implementation of the Decade, and urged States to ensure that it would focus attention on the plight of the victims of historical injustices and contribute to the realization of all their human rights and fundamental freedoms, through initiatives that would be undertaken by States and various stakeholders in the framework of the Decade. The representative asked the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights and the international community to give the highest priority to the programmes for combating racism and racial discrimination and to ensure the success of the International Decade for People of African Descent. The representative also

inquired how OHCHR was planning to implement recommendation 78(d) of the most recent report of the Secretary-General on that topic (A/70/339).

- 32. Mr. Boychenko remarked that OHCHR was undertaking relevant research. Three studies were in the pipeline. One on people of African descent and the right to development would be finalized before the end of 2015. Another study on racial and ethnic profiling had been initiated and a third study devoted to data collection would be finalized in 2016.
- 33. The representative of Mexico underlined how important it was to secure the rights of people of African descent. As member of the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, Mexico had adopted a programme of action to address the vulnerable situation of people of African descent in the region. It was essential to make African descendants as visible as possible. Mexico had faced a number of difficulties, as the group was small. In March 2015 the Government announced its national action plan for the implementation of the Decade. The main purpose of the plan was to consolidate a variety of actions and it was based on the theme of the Decade: recognition, justice and development.
- 34. The Chair noted that the greatest enemy of people of African descent is the lack of visibility. He consequently inquired about the United Nations media strategy for the decade. In response, Mr. Boychenko noted that the Department of Public information had received funds for a campaign. The Office and the Department had prepared a manual on the decade. Further material would be published by the Department. In addition, a number of informative one-pagers had been produced. One additional one-pager on racial profiling was being drafted. The Decade had become a cross-cutting topic for many activities. The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights had also sent instructions to the field offices about the importance of the Decade and had requested contributions from colleagues in the field. Mr. Boychenko pointed out that the media did not always step forward to cover the Decade. The Working Group's visit to Sweden had, for example, been well covered by Swedish media.
- 35. Answering a question about the budget dedicated to the decade Mr. Boychenko noted that originally the establishment of three posts had been planned. The recruitment for those posts however, coincided with the financial difficulties the Office had encountered and, in order to save staff positions, the three posts had been filled by staff members, who would otherwise have lost their jobs.
- 36. The representative of the European Union noted that one needed to agree on the modalities for the forum, and Mr. Boychenko agreed, stating that the Office had received a number of submissions regarding that question and had posted them on its website.
- 37. A number of delegations inquired if OHCHR would work with regional organizations and treaty bodies to further the decade. South Africa encouraged the Office to cooperate with the African Union Commission delegation located in Geneva. Mr. Boychenko said that OHCHR was in particular working with organizations in Latin America, where the vast majority of African descendants lived. He would, however, also appreciate contacts at other organizations and would be grateful if delegations could establish those contacts. Mr. Boychenko also noted that the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was a key partner to further the Decade. Other treaty bodies needed to be involved in the future.
- 38. The Arab Commission for Human Rights underlined the importance of regional institutions and organizations as well as the importance of the treaty bodies; the importance of the role of religious, cultural and community leaders in the global campaign against racism, in the context of the Decade; and the importance of sharing good practices.

39. The representative of the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuelan noted that his country supported the fight against racism. He stated that within the framework of the Decade, the issue of reparations needed to be discussed.

# IV. Discussion concerning the preparations for the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action

- 40. Several delegations noted that the full and effective implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action by all States was fundamental for the prevention and elimination of racism and discrimination in all regions.
- 41. The representative of Brazil noted that the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action had inspired legislation, plans of actions and public policies, particularly affirmative action policies, for the promotion of racial equality. Brazil invited all delegations to assess both the progress achieved in fighting racism and racial discrimination and the important challenges that remained. The fifteenth anniversary would provide a unique opportunity to identify challenges and exchange good practices for its full and effective implementation. In regard to activities to commemorate the anniversary, the representative suggested a panel discussion in the Human Rights Council in 2016.
- The representative of the European Union stated that despite many good efforts by the international community, the objectives and commitments undertaken at the 2001 Durban conference were still far from being fully met. The European Union had a strong legal and policy framework in place to prevent and fight racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. Racial or ethnic discrimination was prohibited by the Charter of Fundamental Rights as well as by several regulations and directives. The European Union had also adopted legislation that banned incitement to racist or xenophobic violence or hatred. Furthermore, all member States were required by European Union law to set up national bodies for the promotion of equal treatment of all persons without discrimination on grounds of racial or ethnic origin and to provide assistance to victims of discrimination. In addition, the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights played an important role in providing information about the situation in the European Union when it came to racism, related intolerance, or unequal treatment of ethnic minorities. The European Union also supported a wide range of non-governmental organizations in their work against racism and in support of non-discrimination through its European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights. The European Union supported having a panel discussion on the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action.
- 43. The representative of Egypt expressed support for the idea of organizing a panel discussion during the Human Rights Council and for organizing an event during the session of the General Assembly to look at achievements and hindrances to the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action.
- 44. A representative of the International Youth and Student Movement for the United Nations suggested holding a full-day discussion during the thirty-third session of the Human Rights Council on the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action. The Office could widely distribute copies of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action in all languages and a multi-year programme of activities and outreach, as envisaged by the General Assembly in its resolution 69/162, could be outlined. The Working Group should submit a report with elements for a multi-year programme to recover lost ground in the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, which could be presented to the Human Rights Council for its consideration.

#### V. Discussion concerning racism and poverty

- Mr. Woodward made a presentation on poverty eradication and the "Africanization" 45. of poverty. He recalled the Millennium Development Goals and target 1, "Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than \$1.25 a day". The new goal, Sustainable Development Goal 1, aims at ending poverty in all its forms everywhere. Target 1.1 adds, "By 2030, eradicate extreme poverty for all people everywhere, currently measured as people living on less than \$1.25 a day". He said that this new formulation included a rights perspective and constituted a move from national responsibility within available means to collective responsibility. It was, however, not clear how that goal could be achieved. Eradication meant eradicating poverty everywhere, including where it was the hardest (the global consumption floor). Mr. Woodward also discussed the current "dollar-aday" approach that constituted an arbitrary level of measurement, often unrelated to living standards. He presented two alternatives: an ethical poverty line or a rights-based poverty line to measure poverty. He also addressed regional trends in, and prospects for, poverty reduction, highlighting the ongoing "Africanization" of global poverty, and presented a broad historical perspective on its causes. By 2030 more than 70 per cent of global poverty would be found in sub-Saharan Africa. Path dependency was one of the reasons for that development. Multiple interconnected vicious circles meant that disadvantage bread further disadvantage. Mr. Woodward concluded by re-emphasizing that the Sustainable Development Goals presented a shift towards a more rights-oriented approach to poverty, but issues regarding the definition of poverty remained. In addition, he noted that the practical consequences of the new approach had yet to be considered. In effect, development needed to be understood in a different way, in Africa and globally.
- 46. Mr. Paixão made a presentation on poverty and racism: multidimensionality and implications for social policy. He noted that for decades poverty was perceived as a simple problem of lack of monetary resources. That approach led to public policy choices based on cash transfers for those who were considered eligible to earn such funds. Now poverty was perceived as a multidimensional phenomenon. Discrimination and poverty were linked. In Latin America people were poor, he argued, because they were part of ethnic minorities. He pointed out that Brazil had the second biggest Afro-descendant population in the world. There had been progress in the eradication of poverty by using cash transfer programmes. Most beneficiaries, around 67 per cent, of such programmes were Afro-descendants. While poverty indicators were declining for that population, violence indicators were at the same time increasing. Homicide statistics showed that the violence was largely focused on Afrodescendants. A number of population graphics showed that in Brazil inequality among "race groups" was striking. Education and access to labour markets were important topics for Afro-descendants. Between 2004 and 2014, the income earnings of Afro-descendants increased by 55 per cent and inequality did decrease. That was a good first step. It was now key to increase access for Afro-descendants to the labour market, in particular when it came to jobs that required education. Education was therefore essential. Brazil still had to manage high drop-out rates among Afro-descendants, even though in that area progress had also been made. The drop-out rate for children aged 7 to 14 fell from 15 per cent to 2per cent. For teenagers the dropout rate was still 15per cent. Mr. Paixao also stressed the importance of political representation for minorities and Afro-Brazilian people in the country's context.
- 47. Ms. Eaddy briefed the Working Group on the correlation between racism and poverty: income inequality, education and access to technology. She focused on the United States of America and examined the disparity in household wealth, home ownership and access to education between ethnic groups. She highlighted the fact that in particular when it came to technology-related jobs, ethnic minorities were underrepresented. Data from the Bureau of Labor Statistics, however, showed that by 2020 there would be 1.4 million new computer science jobs in the United States. At the same time, the average technology

worker made more than the median household income of an African-American family and a Latino family combined, indicating the great economic opportunity in expanded access to the technology sector. The pathway out of poverty was through increased equitable educational access and economic opportunity, she concluded. As jobs and opportunity in the technology sector continued to increase in the global economy, it would be vital for traditionally marginalized communities to have both the skill set and unfettered access to the technology industry. She therefore recommended a set of policy measures, namely:

- Policies that expanded equal access to mainstream financial services and affordable rental and owner-occupied housing
- Policies that incentivized schools and school districts to increase diversity and decrease racial and socioeconomic isolation
- Policies that provided significant resources to support educational access and opportunities for underrepresented communities
- Policies that significantly expanded science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) education and access to computer science education
- Policies that expanded access to technology and broadband Internet access, specifically programmes that expanded mobile technology as a means to expand education and financial access
- 48. Mr. Thierry del Prado delivered a statement on behalf of Mr. Ruteere, the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. He noted that in the report of the Special Rapporteur to the General Assembly in November 2013 (A/68/333), he had addressed the issues of racism and poverty. The Special Rapporteur had found that the continuing socioeconomic vulnerability of minorities was frequently the result of historical legacies. In the report, he analysed the legal and policy frameworks at the national, regional and international levels; the manifestations of poverty and racism in the areas of economic and social rights such as education, adequate housing and health care; and other rights, including the right to work in just conditions, social security, food and water. Education remained an important vehicle for freeing racial and ethnic minorities from poverty, as it provided them with the skills and opportunities for better livelihoods. Realizing the right to education for all children and, in particular, for racial and ethnic minorities should be the one of the cornerstones of the strategies directed at reducing poverty and ending discrimination. Another important issue was health care, as vulnerable and marginalized groups faced obstacles in accessing health care. Similarly, legal insecurity of tenure for poor and marginalized ethnic and racial minorities forced some of the members of those communities to move to urban areas, where the only affordable housing was in informal and slum settlements with substandard housing conditions and the daily risks of eviction. This year, he concluded, his report to the Assembly would be on the need for better data and research to address the problem of racial discrimination and the structural inequalities associated with race and ethnicity. The achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals, adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 70/1 of 25 September 2015, hinged on the collection and utilization of disaggregated data.
- 49. Mr. López made a presentation on racial discrimination and poverty in Colombia. He noted that only the implementation of policies of affirmative action or positive differentiation could improve the quality of life of the poorest Afro-Colombian and indigenous people. In addition, such policies would encourage processes of upward social mobility for those who made great efforts to invest in human capital. Mr. López proposed a number of policies in that regard, as follows:

- Inclusion policies to promote greater accumulation of quality human capital for the Afro-descendant population. That implied eliminating discrimination against Afro descendants, in such a way that they could improve their skills and compete on equal terms for positions of higher socioeconomic status, which was the basic principle in a meritocratic society
- Inclusion policies in the labour market that would improve the employability of the Afro-descendant population
- Inclusion policies for encouraging entrepreneurship and supporting productive initiatives
- Inclusion policies to encourage and strengthen productive clusters where Afrodescendants had comparative advantages, drawn from their cultural particularities.
   That meant support for micro-, small and medium enterprises, which were based on their cultural frameworks
- Social inclusion policies to strengthen public institutions and enable them to be transparent and efficient
- 50. During the discussion that followed, the representative of Brazil noted that poverty was both a cause and a consequence of discrimination, particularly racial discrimination. Development should not be narrowly defined as economic development but should also include political, economic, social, cultural and environmental aspects, consistent with international human rights instruments. The principles of participation, equality and non-discrimination should be integrated into all development activities and programmes. The realization of human rights, including with respect to the fight against poverty and access to education, health, employment and political participation, had to be among the goals of development. Brazil recognized the challenges it faced concerning racism, as well as the importance of adopting public policies to overcome them. Affirmative measures, along with universal policies to eradicate poverty, had contributed to a significant decrease in income inequality between racial groups.
- 51. The representative of the European Union noted that the discussion on that topic was relevant, as the General Assembly had just adopted the new Sustainable Development Goals that would now determine the direction of global and national policies for the next 15 years. From a human rights perspective, the outcome document of the Assembly summit was very promising. It aimed at promoting a transformative, universal and human rights-based development agenda. It was an agenda that should protect human dignity and contribute to the realization of human rights for all, without discrimination of any kind. In fact, several of the new Goals had key human rights components and several of the targets adopted a human rights-based approach. That marked a significant evolution compared to the Millennium Development Goals: It was now recognized by all that the new development agenda could be sustainable only if it were firmly anchored in human rights. The European Union started a similar approach some years ago when it launched its own internal process of truly integrating human rights into its own development cooperation activities in fact, into all of its external actions.
- 52. The representative of China noted that poverty in China had been significantly reduced, in particular the poverty of the rural population. More than 60 per cent of the global reduction in poverty was due to the reduction of poverty in China. The Government of China was currently drafting the next five-year poverty reduction programme. China had also cooperated with others on global poverty reduction and had provided assistance to a variety of countries in order to reduce poverty. China would also give 0 per cent loans for small island developing States, least developed countries and landlocked developing countries. That approach emphasized South-South cooperation. Poverty, the Chinese representative concluded, contributed to social problems, including racism.

- The representative of South Africa noted that poverty eradication was the world's 53. greatest challenge. The triple challenges of poverty, inequality, and unemployment continued to inhibit global development. If the United Nations did not deal with the scourges of poverty, underdevelopment and disease, the poor of the world would consider that the United Nations had failed them. Thus, South Africa had been working closely with all States Members of the United Nations towards the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (General Assembly resolution 70/1). Earlier in 2015, Statistics South Africa had published a report that updated the national and provincial poverty lines, setting the minimum socially acceptable standard to separate the poor from the non-poor. The World Bank released a report that commended South Africa's "slightly progressive" tax system and "highly progressive" government spending — around 3.6 million people had been lifted out of poverty, halving the number of South Africans living on less than \$1.25 a day. Owing to grants, free basic services and taxes favouring the poor, the poverty rate dropped from 46.2 per cent to 39 per cent. The representative also reaffirmed that education, development and the faithful implementation of all international human rights norms and obligations, including the enactment of laws and political, social and economic policies, were crucial to combat racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. The representative recommended that Mr. Woodward's rights-based poverty line should be further considered and that Mr. Paixão's recommendation on the imperative need to have monitoring tools should be included in the conclusions of the session.
- 54. The representative of the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela noted that that country had also sought to eradicate poverty, and that it also supported the approach and policies of the Government of Brazil. Many challenges remained, but existing programmes aimed at addressing them. The Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela had a number of national programmes that addressed poverty, and over the past decade extreme poverty had been halved. The Gini coefficient of the country was one of the lowest in the region. That was mainly due to social policies, including "inclusion programmes" and heavy investments in social programmes. The representative asked Mr. Woodward about the issue of public debt. Mr. Woodward replied that debt continued to pose a problem for some countries. Achieving the Sustainable Development Goals would require massive investments from developing countries. However, it was not clear where the money would originate. South-South cooperation would become more important in that regard.
- 55. Mr. Woodward added that there was an implicit link between the Sustainable Development Goals and discrimination, as the underlying goal was to leave no one behind. The universality of the goal was a helpful step towards non-discrimination. Equally important was the move from anti-poverty policies as charity to anti-poverty policies as a human right. That constituted an important shift of perception. Such a human-rights based approach meant in practice that one had to rethink the current development model. Economics was about maximizing production, but that approach had, for example, not considered environmental effects. The Goals would present an alternative approach.

#### VI. Final statements

56. The representative of Mexico, on behalf of his delegation and the delegations of Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, Costa Rica, Guatemala, Paraguay and Uruguay, reiterated the commitment of their respective countries to the effective implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action. He noted that the effective fight against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance required the implementation of laws and concrete, specific and measurable national policies. He further reiterated the support of the respective countries for the International Decade for People of African Descent and their commitment to the full implementation of the programme of activities for

the implementation of the Decade, in accordance with General Assembly resolution 69/16. He emphasized that as part of that commitment some countries in Latin America had already developed national plans for the implementation of the international decade and noted with satisfaction the organization in Brasilia of the first regional conference on the Decade.

57. With reference to the forum for people of African descent, he recalled that the forum should serve as a mechanism of broad consultation and inclusive participation of all people of African descent and should fall within one of the existing Durban follow-up mechanisms. In that regard, he highlighted the efficiency of the Working Group during the present session. He suggested, in that regard, the holding of informal consultations to discuss the possibility of transferring three days of the Working Group and the related budgetary resources to the forum for people of African descent.

#### VII. Conclusions and recommendations

## A. Implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent

#### 58. The Working Group:

- (a) Invites Member States to implement the programme of activities for the implementation of the International Decade for People of African Descent, adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 69/16, and to consider the Decade as an opportunity to review the situation of people of African descent in their respective communities, analyse patterns of discrimination and raise awareness among the general public of their contributions, including to global development. In this regard, the Working Group notes that it is important to collate recent, relevant and disaggregated data, as appropriate, to assess adequately the challenges faced by people of African descent;
- (b) Encourages Member States to adopt and implement comprehensive public policies to further promote and protect the human rights of people of African descent as enshrined in international human rights instruments, including special measures, such as affirmative action, where appropriate, with clear and sustainable objectives which increase the visibility of people of African descent and ensure their full, effective and equal participation in decision-making processes;
- (c) Also encourages Member States to put into place or strengthen national mechanisms to combat racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, with a focus on people of African descent, including through awareness-raising campaigns;
- (d) Encourages the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights to liaise with regional organizations from all over the world, treaty bodies and the special procedures of the Human Rights Council to enable them to contribute to the effective implementation of the programme of activities for the implementation of the Decade;
- (e) Invites the Office to enhance its cooperation with international and national media organizations, business, academia, civil society organizations and other stakeholders to increase visibility and awareness of the Decade;
- (f) Notes with appreciation that the first regional meeting on the Decade, the Regional Meeting for Latin America and the Caribbean, will take place in Brasilia on 3 and 4 December 2015;

- (g) Encourages all Member States, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, private institutions and individuals, as well as other donors in a position to do so, to contribute generously to the Trust Fund for the programme of activities for the Decade, with a view to contributing to its successful implementation;
- (h) Notes with appreciation the efforts undertaken by the Office to launch an information campaign to promote the Decade and build support, and encourages the Department of Public Information of the Secretariat, in collaboration with the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, through its information offices, to further implement para 29 (c) of the programme of activities, which requests the Department, UNESCO and the Office and regional and subregional organizations to launch an awareness-raising campaign to inform the general public of the history, contributions, including to global development, challenges, contemporary experiences and situation of human rights of people of African descent, and, in that connection, encourages them to continue organizing public events for the promotion of the Decade, including in connection with Human Rights Day, 10 December;
- (i) Decides to include as a standing item in its annual sessions the implementation of the programme of activities for implementation the International Decade for People of African Descent.

## B. Preparations for the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action

- 59. The Working Group reaffirms that the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action provide a comprehensive United Nations framework and a solid foundation for combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, and recalls paragraph 20 of General Assembly resolution 69/162 in which the Assembly calls upon the Human Rights Council to commence preparations for the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, including through the Intergovernmental Working Group on the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action. In this regard, the Working Group:
- (a) Recommends to the President of the Human Rights Council that in 2016, on the occasion of the fifteenth anniversary of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, the focus and the theme of the annual commemoration of the International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination be on the assessment of the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action over the past 15 years, including identifying achievements, challenges and good practices. In that regard, consideration should be given to inviting the chairs of all the follow-up mechanisms to the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and the relevant human rights bodies and mechanisms, such as the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of slavery and representatives of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination;
- (b) Recognizes the importance of the involvement of non-governmental organizations in the observance of the fifteenth anniversary of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, and invites Member States, intergovernmental organizations and other actors to consider providing support to enable non-

governmental organizations to organize and participate in the activities of the fifteenth anniversary;

- (c) Invites relevant stakeholders, including non-governmental organizations, to participate fully in the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action.
- 60. The Working Group highlights the importance of increasing public support for the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and the involvement of relevant stakeholders in its realization. In that regard the Working Group:
- (a) Invites Member States, international and regional organizations, civil society and other stakeholders to organize various initiatives to commemorate the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action that have high visibility and that celebrate positive developments, address remaining challenges and are aimed at effectively increasing awareness at all levels;
- (b) Encourages the timely creation of a web page devoted to the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, at www.un.org. The web page on the fifteenth anniversary should also contain links to the websites of the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance of 2001, the Durban Review Conference, the tenth anniversary of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and the International Decade for People of African Descent;
- (c) Calls upon the Office to intensify efforts to widely distribute copies of and information about the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and the outcome document of the Durban Review Conference, as well as the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, including through the best use of the aforementioned website;
- (d) Encourages the Office and the Department of Public Information to prepare user-friendly materials containing information on the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and widely disseminate them, through such means and structures as United Nations information centres;
- (e) Encourages Member States to consider organizing events, including those of a cultural nature, related to the commemoration of the fifteenth anniversary of the adoption of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action;
- (f) Encourages the Office to develop a multi-year programme of activities to provide for the renewed and strengthened outreach activities needed to inform and mobilize the global public in support of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and to strengthen awareness of the contribution that it has made in the struggle against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

#### C. Racism and poverty

#### 61. The Working Group:

(a) Reaffirms that poverty, underdevelopment, marginalization, social exclusion and economic disparities are closely associated with racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and contribute to the persistence of racist attitudes and practices which in turn generate more poverty;

- (b) Encourages States to take that close correlation into consideration when they plan and implement policies and programmes for development, poverty eradication, and reducing social exclusion;
- (c) Welcomes the recently adopted 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, which is strongly grounded in the human rights principles of non-discrimination, inclusiveness, equality and human dignity, and encourages States to put into practice these principles for development;
- (d) Supports the universal respect for promotion, protection and fulfilment of all human rights in efforts to address poverty eradication;
- (e) Notes that quality education, development and human rights are crucial to combat racism and poverty;
- (f) Encourages Member States to ensure that the realization of the right to education for all, including children, and in particular for national, ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities, is one of the cornerstones of efforts directed at reducing poverty and ending discrimination;
- (g) Notes that some of the gravest and most neglected problems are poverty, inequality and unemployment in rural areas, including the lack of full realization of all human rights, inter alia, the right of everyone to the full enjoyment of the highest attainable standards of physical and mental health, and that disparities sometimes result from policies and programmes which intentionally or unintentionally concentrate services in urban areas, and in that context encourages Member States, when combating poverty, to take into consideration the situation and needs of the poor in rural areas;
- (h) Expresses its concern that in many parts of the world the Millennium Development Goal of reducing by half, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people living on less than one dollar a day, has so far not been met, and that, similarly, the relevant commitments made in the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, adopted by the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance in 2001, have not been realized;
- (i) Appeals to Member States, individually or through international cooperation, to enhance their policies and measures to reduce income and wealth inequalities, as well as their policies related to quality education, access to job markets, and health services;
- (j) Reaffirms the importance and necessity of ensuring full integration of all, including the victims of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, into social, economic and political life, with a view to facilitating their full participation at all levels of the decision-making process;
- (k) Underlines that economic policies should increase social welfare as appropriate, including by giving priority to programmes designed to combat racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, and to that end encourages national, regional and international financial institutions to take into consideration and address racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance in all relevant projects, programmes and activities, as appropriate, including poverty and social impact assessments;
- (l) Recognizes that human development, including quality education, which ensure employability, empowerment and the participation of men and women from vulnerable groups in the political and economic mainstream and decision-making processes of their countries, is a crucial element in the eradication of poverty, and in

this regard reaffirms all its conclusions and recommendations adopted during its ninth and tenth sessions, respectively, on the role of education in combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and on the role of politicians and political parties in combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance;

- (m) Encourages Member States to design adequate programmes for human resource development, including capacity-building policies and strategies;
- (n) Also encourages States to formulate and further strengthen their national programmes for eradicating poverty and reducing social exclusion, and to that end further encourages States that have already included those aspects in their activities to send such information to the Office for inclusion as best practices in its anti-discrimination database;
- (o) Encourages Member States, when engaging in poverty reduction strategies, to promote transparent and fully effective participatory processes that include victims of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance;
- (p) Emphasizes the importance of the socioeconomic environment for an inclusive society, inter alia, through the establishment of social security systems and fair wages, equal remuneration for work of equal value without distinction of any kind and access to justice for all, in particular, for victims of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance;
- (q) Highlights the importance, as appropriate, of the effective collection and analysis of statistical data, including disaggregated data in accordance with national legislation, by national authorities for the design, implementation and evaluation of poverty eradication programmes and policies for the benefit of victims of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

#### Annex I

#### List of attendance

#### **Member States**

Algeria, Argentina, Armenia, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, China, Colombia, Costa Rica, Côte d'Ivoire, Cuba, Djibouti, Dominican Republic, Egypt, Ethiopia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Guatemala, India, Indonesia, Iran (Islamic Republic of), Israel, Japan, Kuwait, Libya, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Mexico, Morocco, Namibia, Nigeria, Norway, Pakistan, Panama, Peru, Portugal, Russian Federation, Somalia, South Africa, Spain, Sudan, Tajikistan, Tunisia, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Uruguay, Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of), Zimbabwe

#### Non-Member States represented by observers

Holy See, State of Palestine

#### **International Organization**

African Union, European Union, Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC), United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA)

## Non-governmental organizations in consultative status with the Economic and Social Council

African Commission of Health and Human Rights Promoters, American Association of Jurists, Association of World Citizens, International Youth and Student Movement for the United Nations

## Non-governmental organizations not in consultative status with the Economic and Social Council

Arab Commission for Human Rights, Culture of Afro-indigenous Solidarity, Moloca International, World Against Racism Network (WARN)

Annex II

### Programme of work

ime	Monday 5 October2015	Tuesday 6 October 2015	Wednesday 7 October 2015	Thursday 8 October 2015	Friday 9 October 2015
Morning: session: from 10:00 to 13:00	Item 1: Opening of the session	– Mr. Yury Boychenko (2) <u>Item 6 (cont'd) or</u>		Item 7 (cont'd)	Item 7 (cont'd)
	Item 2: Election of the Chair-Rapporteur	Chief, Anti-Racial Discrimination Section  Discussion  Item 5 (cont'd)  Discussion	Item 7: Discussion on conclusions and recommendations on items 5 and 6		
	Item 3: Adoption of the programme of work  Item 4: General Statement by States and Regional groups				
	Statement by Civil Society Organization				
	<u>Item 5</u> : Discussion on the implementation of the Programme of Activities of the International Decade for People of African Descent (IDPAD)				
	Presentation by:				
	– Mr. Celeste Ugochukwu				
	President of African Diaspora Council of Switzerland and member of the Swiss Federal Commission Against Racism				
<u> </u>	Item 5 (cont'd)	Item 6:	Item 7 (cont'd)	Item 7 (cont'd)	Item 7 (cont'd)
Afternoon session: from 15:00 to 18:00	Presentation by:	Preparation of the 15 <sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the adoption of the Durban	Discussion on conclusions and recommendations on items 5 and 6		
	– Ms. Carole Boyce Davis				
	Professor of Africana Studies at Cornell University, New York	Declaration and PoA (DDPA)			
Alte		Discussion			

Time	Monday 12 October 2015	Tuesday 13 October 2015	Wednesday 14 October 2015	Thursday 15 October 2015	Friday 16 October 2015
	Item 8: Discussion on Racism and Poverty			Item 9 (cont'd)	Preparation
Morning: session: from 10:00 to 13:00	Presentation by:				of the report
	– Mr. David Woodward				
	Senior Advisor, UNCTAD				
	– Mr. Marcelo Jorge De Paula Paixao				
	Professor of African and African Diaspora Studies at Austin University – Texas				
	– Ms. Jotaka Eaddy				
	Advisor on government and regulatory affairs for Silicon Valley based companies (Washington DC)				
	Discussion				
Afternoon session: from 15:00 to 18:00	Item 8 (cont'd)	Item 9 (cont'd)	Item 9 (cont'd)	Preparation	Adoption
	– Mr. Carlos Augusto Viáfara López			of the report	of the report
	Associate Professor in Economics Department at the Universidad del Valle				
	Discussion				